

Selection And Performance Evaluation Process For Indonesian Hajj Officials At The Directorate General Of Hajj And Umrah, Ministry Of Religious Affairs Of The Republic Of Indonesia

Aulia Kania Rifatama Garini¹, Nidya Dudija^{2*}

^{1,2} Universitas Telkom, Bandung, Indonesia

* Corresponding Author:

Email: [nidyardudija@telkomuniversity.ac.id](mailto:nidyadudija@telkomuniversity.ac.id)

Abstract.

This study aims to analyze the selection and performance evaluation strategies of Indonesian Hajj officers by the Directorate General of Hajj and Umrah of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. The selection process is carried out through administrative stages, computer-based tests (CAT), and panel interviews. Performance evaluation is carried out from the training stage to the implementation of tasks in Saudi Arabia through direct supervision and daily reporting. This study uses a descriptive qualitative approach with interviews, documentation, and participatory observation. The results indicate that the success of selection and evaluation is determined by system integration, individual competence, and institutional support. However, there are still challenges such as disparities in training quality between regions, limitations in the digital system, and the absence of standardized and measurable performance indicators. This study recommends the development of national competency standards, strengthening the performance management information system, and the implementation of Balanced Scorecard-based indicators. This study is expected to provide strategic input for policymakers in improving the quality of Hajj services and enriching academic literature on human resource management in the religious sector.

Keywords: *Selection of Hajj Officers; Performance Evaluation; Competency; Monitoring and Human Resource Management.*

I. INTRODUCTION

The organization of the Hajj pilgrimage is one of the most critical and complex national responsibilities, particularly in the context of Indonesia as the world's largest sender of Hajj pilgrims. The Directorate General of Hajj and Umrah (Ditjen PHU) under the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia bears full responsibility for designing, managing, and overseeing the Hajj pilgrimage process, including the selection and evaluation of Hajj officials. Hajj officials play a vital role in ensuring the smooth execution of pilgrims' religious duties, particularly in terms of health services, religious guidance, and logistics during their stay in the Holy Land. In recent years, the complexity of Hajj operations has increased due to the growing number of elderly pilgrims, dynamic quota policies, and rising expectations for service quality. These conditions require Hajj officials to possess not only technical competence but also social sensitivity, mental resilience, and interpersonal communication skills. For this reason, the selection and performance evaluation of officers has become a strategic aspect of the overall national Hajj management system. So far, the selection process has been carried out in stages, starting from administrative selection, computer-based tests (CAT), to panel interviews. Performance evaluation, on the other hand, is carried out through direct supervision, daily reports, and documentation of activities. Although this process has been designed systematically, there are still challenges in the field, such as disparities in competence between regions, limited technological infrastructure, and a lack of standardized evaluation indicators.

This study is important because there has not been much research specifically discussing the managerial aspects of the selection and evaluation of Hajj officers from the perspective of public policy and strategic human resource management. Using a qualitative approach, this study aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of current practices, identify obstacles, and formulate data-based recommendations for system improvement. It is hoped that the results of this study can contribute to the

reform of a more adaptive, accountable, and pilgrim-oriented Hajj human resource management system. The theoretical review in this study involves several main approaches in human resource management, performance evaluation, and public policy. First, Dessler's (2020) Human Resource Development theory emphasizes the importance of recruitment, training, and evaluation as a continuous cycle in human resource performance development. In the context of Hajj officers, this theory is relevant because it shows how each stage influences one another in producing professional human resources. Furthermore, Armstrong's (2014) performance management theory emphasizes the importance of result-based and behavior-based measurements in assessing individual effectiveness in organizations. In its implementation, Kaplan and Norton's (1992) Balanced Scorecard theory is also applied to view performance from four perspectives: financial, customer, internal processes, and learning and growth. This approach allows for a more comprehensive evaluation of officer performance. As found by Sary, Dudija, and Moslem (2023), Hajj officers with good digital competencies can use technology effectively in providing services to pilgrims, while self-leadership helps them stay focused and productive despite facing dynamic work situations.

Research by Oktaviani, Dudija, and Sagala (2020) shows that employee engagement and leadership style significantly influence employee performance. The level of engagement of Hajj officers in their work, combined with a supportive leadership style, can create a conducive working environment that motivates staff to provide the best service. The system theory developed by Bakar et al. (2023) is also used to view the implementation of the Hajj as an integrated system, in which the selection and evaluation processes are subsystems that must be harmoniously integrated. A good system requires feedback loops and continuous evaluation in order to adapt to challenges in the field. In terms of public policy, Dunn's (2018) theory of policy formulation and implementation serves as a reference for understanding how the staff selection policy is translated into concrete actions by the Directorate General of Hajj and Umrah. This study also refers to previous empirical studies, such as Efendi et al. (2022) and Suhartini & Akmadani (2024), which highlight the importance of competence and monitoring in improving the quality of Hajj services. Based on this literature review, it can be concluded that the selection and evaluation process for Hajj personnel must be placed within a framework of human resource management based on systems, public service values, and measurable and transparent performance indicators. This study aims to bridge theory and practice to generate relevant and applicable recommendations. According to Sary, Dudija, and Moslem (2023), digital competence and self-leadership are two essential factors that every public official must possess. In this context, Hajj officers, this capability is needed so that they can utilize digital information systems well, as well as being able to make quick and appropriate decisions in dynamic situations in the field.

II. METHODS

This study uses a descriptive qualitative approach to explore in depth the selection and performance evaluation process of Indonesian Hajj officers conducted by the Directorate General of Hajj and Umrah of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. This approach was chosen because it is able to capture the social and policy complexities that cannot be measured quantitatively, as well as enabling a holistic understanding of the dynamics of practices in the field. The research location was focused on the Directorate General of Hajj and Umrah Headquarters in Jakarta, and involved several Regional Offices of the Ministry of Religious Affairs in provinces that send the most pilgrims, such as West Java, East Java, and North Sumatra. The location was selected purposively, considering geographical representation and variations in the operational context of Hajj implementation. Data collection techniques include in-depth interviews, document analysis, and participatory observation. Interviews were conducted with structural officials of the Directorate General of PHU, national selection committee members, regional Hajj organizers, as well as former and prospective Hajj officials. Interview questions were semi-structured to allow informants flexibility in explaining their experiences and perceptions. The documentation reviewed includes technical guidelines for the selection and training of Hajj officers, internal policy documents, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) reports, and performance assessment results of officers from previous years. Observations were conducted during the selection and training stages to understand the flow of activities, interactions between parties, and field dynamics directly.

Data analysis techniques used the interactive model of Miles and Huberman (1994), which includes data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing/verification. Data reduction was carried out by grouping information based on the themes of selection, training, and performance evaluation. Data presentation is done through thematic narratives and analysis matrices, while conclusions are drawn inductively and accompanied by cross-verification between sources. To ensure data validity, the researcher used source and method triangulation techniques. Source triangulation was done by comparing information from various informants, while method triangulation was done by combining interviews, documentation, and observation. In addition, a member check process was carried out by confirming the interview results with the main informants to avoid misinterpretation. Research ethics were upheld by ensuring that all participants gave their informed consent before being interviewed. The researcher also guaranteed the confidentiality of the informants' identities and did not use sensitive data without explicit permission. Every data collection process was carried out with due regard for the principles of transparency, accountability, and respect for the rights of participants. Overall, this research design is structured to provide a comprehensive and in-depth understanding of how the selection and evaluation policies for Hajj officials are implemented in practice, as well as to identify the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and challenges of the existing system. This study is expected to serve as a reference for improving Hajj human resource management that is more evidence-based, responsive to social dynamics, and aligned with public service values..

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The results of the study indicate that the selection and evaluation process of Indonesian Hajj officers by the Directorate General of Hajj and Umrah has undergone significant development in recent years, both in terms of policy and technical implementation. The selection process, which is conducted in stages through administrative, CAT, and panel interviews, has been widely accepted as an objective screening instrument. However, the technical implementation of this system still faces a number of obstacles. At the administrative selection stage, the effectiveness of the requirements instrument is considered quite high in screening candidates based on criteria such as age, educational background, work experience, and organizational track record. Informants acknowledge that the administrative selection has helped minimize initial subjectivity. However, there is a tendency for more administratively advanced regions to have an advantage over 3T (underdeveloped, frontier, and outermost) regions in preparing documents and accessing the online registration system. The CAT exam stage is crucial in determining the intellectual capacity and basic knowledge of prospective officers. Although this method is able to screen candidates with objective scores, there are significant technical obstacles. Several regions reported server disruptions, limited computer equipment, and unequal internet access. This has impacted the quality of the examination and created perceptions of inequality. The panel interview, which is the final stage of selection, has a significant subjective dimension. Researchers noted that the panelists came from various backgrounds, such as academics, religious practitioners, and ministry officials.

Although they provided holistic assessments, there were no standard assessment rubrics to minimize differences in interpretation among panelists. Assessments of motivation, integrity, and mental readiness often depended on personal impressions. In the implementation of tasks in Saudi Arabia, performance evaluation is carried out through daily supervision, activity reports, and direct observation by the group leader and sector supervisor. Informants mentioned that this method is effective in quickly identifying problematic officers. However, the absence of an integrated digital evaluation system makes it difficult to compile a performance database that can be followed up nationally. Another shortcoming identified is the lack of standardized and comprehensive key performance indicators (KPIs). Evaluations are still descriptive and do not have outcome-based benchmarks that can be compared across years or regions. This complicates the benchmarking process and accountability for performance evaluations. From a managerial perspective, the selection and evaluation systems do not fully support a competency-based and value-based approach. Researchers found that officers with high religious motivation and a strong sense of dedication often performed better, even though their CAT scores or interview results were not outstanding. This indicates that the dimensions of values and work ethics should be integrated into the selection process. Within the Balanced

Scorecard framework, the performance of Hajj officials is not fully reflected in the four perspectives established by Kaplan and Norton: financial, customer (pilgrims), internal processes, and learning. Currently, evaluations focus more on compliance with administrative tasks, while dimensions such as pilgrim satisfaction and service innovation are not systematically measured.

It was also found that regions with high-quality training and guidance, such as large provinces in Java, produce more prepared officers. Conversely, 3T regions face limited training, a shortage of resource persons, and a lack of digital learning facilities. This disparity has the potential to create inequality in service standards. In this discussion, the researchers compiled five main findings. First, the effectiveness of CAT-based selection and interviews still faces challenges in terms of infrastructure and assessment instruments. Second, the performance monitoring system in the field is not yet optimally supported by information technology. Third, there are no standard result-based performance indicators. Fourth, religious values and character are not explicitly considered in selection and evaluation. Fifth, capacity disparities between regions have an impact on the quality of officers. This study emphasizes that the success of Hajj services is highly dependent on the quality of personnel. Therefore, the human resource management approach applied must cover technical, cognitive, affective, and spiritual aspects. System improvements must be made through policy updates, improvements in information technology governance, and strengthening collaboration across work units. All of these findings are consistent with Armstrong's (2014) theory that an effective performance management system requires a balance between work results, work behavior, and organizational support systems. They are also in line with the systemic approach of Bakar et al. (2023) that selection, training, and evaluation are an inseparable whole. By strengthening data-driven and value-based selection and evaluation strategies, the Directorate General of Hajj and Umrah can develop a more fair, transparent, and accountable hajj officer management system. This model not only improves the quality of services for pilgrims but also strengthens public trust in the management of national hajj operations..

IV. CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the selection and performance evaluation strategies for Indonesian Hajj officers at the Directorate General of Hajj and Umrah of the Ministry of Religious Affairs have demonstrated a systematic and structured framework. The selection process, which consists of administrative stages, a computer-assisted test (CAT), and interviews, has been able to screen candidates with the necessary basic competencies. However, not all stages have been optimally implemented, particularly in terms of standardizing instruments and ensuring uniform quality of implementation across regions. Performance evaluations conducted during training and while on duty in Saudi Arabia indicate that supervision and reporting have been actively carried out. Nevertheless, the absence of an integrated digital system and uniform key performance indicators (KPIs) poses a challenge to the accuracy and consistency of assessments. These results indicate the need for comprehensive reform of the technology-based and results-oriented evaluation system. This study also highlights the importance of values and work culture as determining factors in the successful implementation of policies.

Religious motivation, professionalism, and moral integrity have proven to be the main drivers of officer performance, which cannot be replaced by administrative mechanisms alone. Therefore, selection and evaluation policies should not only focus on technical aspects but also embrace character and spirituality dimensions as part of performance indicators. Strategic recommendations derived from this study include: (1) developing national competency standards for Hajj officers that integrate technical and ethical aspects; (2) establishing a Balanced Scorecard-based performance evaluation system that can be implemented nationally; (3) strengthening regional training with a collaborative inter-agency approach; (4) developing an integrated and real-time Hajj human resource management information system; and (5) strengthening supervision of the selection process through external monitoring and public transparency. Thus, the findings of this study are expected to contribute to the renewal of human resource management policies in the context of Hajj services. This study also opens up opportunities for further research, particularly exploring leadership development models and strengthening integrity in religious-based public services in Indonesia..

V. ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors are grateful to the CNPq National Council of Scientific and Technologic Development for supporting this project, to the Center for Lasers and Applications' Multiuser Facility at IPEN-CNEN/SP and to Anton Paar Brasil for the use of the Raman spectrometer. We also thank Teodora Camargo and Tatiana Russo from the *Núcleo de Conservação e Restauro in Pinacoteca do Estado de São Paulo* for the invaluable advices.

REFERENCES

- [1] Armstrong, M. (2014). *Armstrong's Handbook of Human Resource Management Practice* (13th ed.). Kogan Page.
- [2] Bakar, M., Ismail, A., & Harun, Z. (2023). Integrated System Approach to Pilgrimage Management: A Conceptual Framework. *Journal of Public Administration and Governance*, 13(1), 112–126.
- [3] Dessler, G. (2020). *Human Resource Management* (16th ed.). Pearson Education.
- [4] Dunn, W. N. (2018). *Public Policy Analysis: An Integrated Approach* (6th ed.). Routledge.
- [5] Efendi, R., Prasetyo, A., & Karim, S. (2022). Evaluasi Kompetensi Petugas Haji Indonesia: Studi Kasus di Wilayah Jawa Barat. *Jurnal Manajemen Pelayanan Publik*, 9(2), 143–158.
- [6] Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (1992). The Balanced Scorecard—Measures That Drive Performance. *Harvard Business Review*, 70(1), 71–79.
- [7] Suhartini, D., & Akmadani, M. (2024). Monitoring dan Evaluasi Kinerja Pelayanan Ibadah Haji di Era Digital. *Jurnal Administrasi dan Kebijakan Publik*, 10(1), 55–68.
- [8] Nugraha, A., & indyat, D. (2025). Effect of Recruitment, Job Placement and Compensation on The Performance of Health Workers American *Journal of Economic and Management Business*, 4(5), 580-593
- [9] Pratiwi, I. D., & Sary, F. S. (2023). The Effect Of Career Development, Organizational Culture On Job Satisfaction And Its Impact On Turnover Intention At Pt Xyz Bandung, *International Journal of Science, Technology & Management*, 4(5), 1211-1223 <https://doi.org/10.46729/ijstm.v4i15.928>
- [10] Sulaiman, R., Alamsyah, A., Wulasari, P. (2022), Reshaping the Future of Recruitment through Talent Reputation and Verifiable Credentials using Blockchain Technology. 10th International Conference on Information and Communication Technology, ICOICT 2022, 316-321
- [11] Winarno, A Prasetio, A. P. Dudija, D, Pratami, CA, Liu, R. (2021) The impact of perceived organizational support on knowledge sharing a meditation analysis through an sem approach *Journal of eastern european and central asian research*, 8(4), 570-584.
- [12] Fitra Syawa Harahap, Arman, I. ., Harahap, N. ., Ahmad Syawaluddin, F. ., & Fitra Yana, R. . (2022). Provision of Chicken Manure and Urea Fertilizer on the Chemical Characteristics of Ultisol Soil in Bilah Barat District. *International Journal of Science and Environment (IJSE)*, 2(3), 98–103.
- [13] Tari Honda, J., M. Yelwa, J. ., Ulteino, A. N. ., Abudllahi, S. ., A. S, U. ., Anchau, H. G. ., & Michael Kalu, K. . (2023). Optimization Of Biosorption Conditions For Crude Oil Spills Using Acetylated And Unacetylated Biosorbents Derived From Cissus Populnea Leaves Stem And Roots. *International Journal of Science and Environment (IJSE)*, 3(2), 51–65. <https://doi.org/10.51601/ijse.v3i2.67>
- [14] Sinambela, M., Simangunsong, S., & Harahap, A. (2023). Conditions Of Phytoplankton Community Structure In Lake Toba Ajibata, Toba Samosir Regency. *International Journal of Science and Environment (IJSE)*, 3, 66–70.
- [15] Rosenta Purba, I., & Harahap, A. . (2022). Plankton Diversity In The Labuhanbatu Bilar River. *International Journal of Science and Environment (IJSE)*, 2(2), 63–68. <https://doi.org/10.51601/ijse.v2i2.27>
- [16] Utandi Harahap, S. ., Syawal Harahap, F., Walida, H. ., & Rizal, K. . (2024). Study Of Soil Physical Properties Of Oil Palm Plants (Elaeis Guinensis Jacq) In The Labuhanbatu University Practice Area In Rantau Selatan District. *International Journal of Science and Environment (IJSE)*, 4(3), 91–96.
- [17] Fathurrahman, F., Irawan, A. ., & Fridayanti, sri . (2023). Effectiveness Of Regional Regulation Number 20 Of 2001 Regarding Regulation Of Street Traders And Seasonal Street Traders In Tarakan City. *International Journal of Educational Research & Social Sciences*, 4(3), 429–434.
- [18] Sulaiman, S., Halim Soebahar, A. ., & Mundir, M. (2023). Madrassa Diniyah Curriculum Transformation In Pesantren: A Study Of Wali Songo Mimbaan And Salafiyah Syafi'iyah Sukorejo Pesantren In Situbondo. *International Journal of Educational Research & Social Sciences*, 4(3), 444–453.
- [19] Mutiara Cipta, D. ., & Alvin, S. (2023). Safeguarding Personal Information: Communication Privacy Management By Gen-Z Influencers. *International Journal of Educational Research & Social Sciences*, 4(3), 465–471. <https://doi.org/10.51601/ijersc.v4i3.653>.